



**Legislative Assembly
Province of Alberta**

No. 19

VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS

First Session

Thirtieth Legislature

Tuesday, June 25, 2019

The Speaker took the Chair at 1:30 p.m.

Members' Statements

Ms Lovely, Hon. Member for Camrose, made a statement regarding the Purple Martin Festival.

Ms Pancholi, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Whitemud, made a statement regarding differences between Government and Official Opposition policies.

Ms Armstrong-Homeniuk, Hon. Member for Fort Saskatchewan-Vegreville, made a statement regarding economic challenges in Vegreville.

Mr. Walker, Hon. Member for Sherwood Park, made a statement regarding the Government's commitment to free enterprise.

Mr. Schmidt, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar, made a statement regarding the Gold Bar Wastewater Treatment Plant.

Mr. Shepherd, Hon. Member for Edmonton-City Centre, made a statement regarding Alberta's health care system.

Tabling Returns and Reports

MLA Ceci, Hon. Member for Calgary-Buffalo:

Email message dated June 21, 2019, to Hon. Mr. Kenney, Premier, President of Executive Council, and Minister of Intergovernmental Relations, expressing opposition to Hon. Mr. Kenney handing out earplugs in the Assembly Chamber
Sessional Paper 116/2019

Ms Sigurdson, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Riverview:

Email message dated June 20, 2019, to Ms Sigurdson, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Riverview, expressing opposition to Hon. Mr. Kenney, Premier, President of Executive Council, and Minister of Intergovernmental Relations, handing out earplugs in the Assembly Chamber
Sessional Paper 117/2019

Email message dated June 21, 2019, to Ms Sigurdson, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Riverview, expressing opposition to Hon. Mr. Kenney, Premier, President of Executive Council, and Minister of Intergovernmental Relations, handing out earplugs in the Assembly Chamber and to Bill 9, Public Sector Wage Arbitration Deferral Act
Sessional Paper 118/2019

Edmonton Journal website article dated June 22, 2019, entitled “Saturday’s letters: Handing out earplugs was arrogant”
Sessional Paper 119/2019

Mrs. Pitt, Hon. Member for Airdrie-East:

2 email messages dated June 16, 2019, senders’ names struck out, to Mrs. Pitt, Hon. Member for Airdrie-East, expressing support for Bill 201, Protection of Students with Life-threatening Allergies Act
Sessional Paper 120/2019

Ms Phillips, Hon. Member for Lethbridge-West:

Email message dated June 20, 2019, from Erin Pinder of Lethbridge to Hon. Mr. Kenney, Premier, President of Executive Council, and Minister of Intergovernmental Relations, expressing opposition to Hon. Mr. Kenney handing out earplugs in the Assembly Chamber
Sessional Paper 121/2019

Email message dated June 20, 2019, to Hon. Mr. Cooper, Speaker of the Legislative Assembly, and Hon. Mr. Kenney, Premier, President of Executive Council, and Minister of Intergovernmental Relations, expressing opposition to Hon. Mr. Kenney handing out earplugs in the Assembly Chamber
Sessional Paper 122/2019

Ms Pancholi, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Whitemud:

Email message dated June 20, 2019, to Ms Pancholi, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Whitemud, attaching a copy of an email to Hon. Mr. Cooper, Speaker of the Legislative Assembly, and a copy of an email to Hon. Mr. Kenney, Premier, President of Executive Council, and Minister of Intergovernmental Relations, expressing opposition to Hon. Mr. Kenney handing out earplugs in the Assembly Chamber

Sessional Paper 123/2019

MLA Irwin, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Highlands-Norwood:

Email message dated June 20, 2019, to MLA Irwin, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Highlands-Norwood, thanking MLA Irwin for fighting against poor decorum in the Assembly Chamber

Sessional Paper 124/2019

Ms Renaud, Hon. Member for St. Albert:

Time magazine article dated October 8, 2018, entitled “Why We Keep Ignoring Even the Most Dire Climate Change Warnings”

Sessional Paper 125/2019

Mr. Dach, Hon. Member for Edmonton-McClung:

Excerpt of book entitled “Top Cat,” relating to comments made by Mr. Dach during Committee of the Whole consideration of Bill 9, Public Sector Wage Arbitration Deferral Act, on June 19, 2019

Sessional Paper 126/2019

Ms Phillips, Hon. Member for Lethbridge-West:

Peace River Bible Institute document, undated, entitled “The Corporation”

Sessional Paper 127/2019

Email message dated June 20, 2019, to Ms Phillips, Hon. Member for Lethbridge-West, expressing opposition to Hon. Mr. Kenney, Premier, President of Executive Council, and Minister of Intergovernmental Relations, handing out earplugs in the Assembly Chamber

Sessional Paper 128/2019

Mr. Bilous, Official Opposition House Leader, on behalf of Ms Notley, Leader of the Official Opposition:

Document entitled “Calgary School District No. 19, as of March 2018” concerning funding for the 2018/2019 school year

Sessional Paper 129/2019

Mr. Nielsen, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Decore:

Website article dated January 4, 2019, entitled “Brazil president: I’d rather have a dead son than a gay son”

Sessional Paper 130/2019

New York Post website article dated November 6, 2017, entitled “Dad accused of murder ‘would rather have a dead son than a gay son’ ”

Sessional Paper 131/2019

Tablings to the Clerk

Clerk of the Assembly on behalf of Hon. Min. LaGrange, Minister of Education, pursuant to the Teaching Profession Act, cT-2, s15(2):

Alberta Teachers’ Association, 2018 Annual Report

Sessional Paper 132/2019

Privilege – Misleading Statements

Honourable Members, I am prepared to rule on the question of privilege raised yesterday, June 24, 2019, by the Official Opposition House Leader relating to comments made by the Government House Leader and Minister of Environment and Parks on June 20, 2019.

The Official Opposition House Leader provided notice to my office at 11:25 a.m. yesterday morning of this question of privilege, with a copy to the Government House Leader, and therefore met the notice requirement under Standing Order 15(2). I might provide some guidance to the Official Opposition House Leader that it is customary to outline in some detail what the purpose of the point of privilege shall be. In this particular case, the letter was vague at best.

As stated in his argument yesterday afternoon, at pages 1113 and 1114 of Hansard, the Official Opposition House Leader alleges that the Government House Leader made – and this is the important part – deliberately misleading statements to the Assembly on June 20, 2019, and that these statements constitute a contempt of the Assembly. The statements in question are found at pages 1079 and 1080 of Hansard from June 20 and were made during Oral Question Period by the Government House Leader in response to questions from the Member for Edmonton-Glenora.

The primary issue raised by the House Leader for the Official Opposition was with respect to the Government House Leader’s answer to the Member for Edmonton-Glenora’s second supplemental question, which can be found at page 1080 of Hansard. The Government House Leader said, “Mr. Speaker, nobody from the Government plugged their ears during debate.”

The test for deliberately misleading the House can be found in the fourth edition of Parliamentary Practice in New Zealand, at pages 775 and 776. That test has three elements:

The statement must, in fact, have been misleading; the Member must have known that the statement was inaccurate at the time the statement was made; and the Member must have intended to mislead the House.

As Speaker Wanner, my predecessor, noted on March 22, 2018, at page 313 of Hansard for that day, this test is very difficult to meet.

I must accept an explanation provided by the Government House Leader, as I must accept any explanation by any Member of this Assembly, for I am duty bound. Yesterday afternoon, at page 1115 of Hansard, the Government House Leader said that his remarks were intended to refer to the members of Executive Council and not the entirety of the Government caucus. On that basis I cannot find that the elements of the test have been met. As is noted at paragraph 494 of Beauchesne's Parliamentary Rules and Forms, sixth edition: "statements by Members respecting themselves and particularly within their own knowledge must be accepted."

I understand that Members of the Opposition have rightly taken offence to certain activities that occurred during the evening sitting on June 19, 2019. Perhaps unsurprisingly, it has not been my experience that there is a positive correlation between sitting late into the night and decorum inside this Assembly. While it is the Opposition's right to raise its concerns regarding incidents that occur within the Chamber that may impact decorum, I want to emphasize that a question of privilege and in particular an assertion that a Member has misled the Assembly is a very serious matter.

I would also like to remind Members that we must all work together, no matter what time the day or night, to ensure that order and decorum are maintained in the Assembly.

There is no prima facie question of privilege with respect to intentionally misleading this House. The matter is now closed.

ORDERS OF THE DAY

Government Motions

21. Oral notice having been given June 17, 2019, moved by Hon. Mr. Nixon:

Be it resolved that the Legislative Assembly express its support for the Government in its efforts to challenge the federal government's attempts to impose a carbon tax on Alberta, which this Assembly views as a clear violation of provincial jurisdiction, including the launching of a constitutional challenge if necessary; acknowledge the negative impacts that a carbon tax has upon the people of Alberta, including the increased cost to heat homes and run businesses in the midst of an economic downturn; and recognize that Alberta's oil and gas industries continue to be global leaders in emissions reduction.

A debate followed.

Hon. Mr. Kenney moved adjournment of debate, which was agreed to.

Government Bills and Orders

Second Reading

On the motion that the following Bill be now read a Second time:

Bill 8 Education Amendment Act, 2019 — Hon. Min. LaGrange

Debate continued on the amendment introduced by Mr. Nielsen, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Decore, on behalf of Mr. Eggen, Hon. Member for Edmonton-North West, on June 24, 2019, that the motion be amended by deleting all of the words after “that” and substituting the following:

Bill 8, Education Amendment Act, 2019, be not now read a Second time but that the subject matter of the Bill be referred to the Standing Committee on Families and Communities in accordance with Standing Order 74.2.

Ms Ganley moved adjournment of the debate on the amendment, which was agreed to.

On the motion that the following Bill be now read a Second time:

Bill 12 Royalty Guarantee Act — Hon. Mrs. Savage

Hon. Mrs. Savage moved adjournment of the debate, which was agreed to.

On the motion that the following Bill be now read a Second time:

Bill 11 Fair Registration Practices Act — Hon. Mr. Copping

A debate followed.

Debate adjourned, Mr. Bilous speaking

Adjournment

The Assembly adjourned at 6:00 p.m. until 7:30 p.m.

Government Bills and Orders

Third Reading

On the motion that the following Bill be now read a Third time:

Bill 5 Appropriation (Supplementary Supply) Act, 2019 (\$) — Hon. Mr. Nixon on behalf of Hon. Mr. Toews

Hon. Mr. Nixon moved adjournment of the debate, which was agreed to.

On the motion that the following Bill be now read a Third time:

Bill 6 Appropriation (Interim Supply) Act, 2019 (\$) — Hon. Mr. Nixon on behalf of Hon. Mr. Toews

A debate followed.

Ms Hoffman moved adjournment of the debate, which was agreed to.

Government Motions

21. Oral notice having been given June 17, 2019, moved by Hon. Mr. Nixon:

Be it resolved that the Legislative Assembly express its support for the Government in its efforts to challenge the federal government's attempts to impose a carbon tax on Alberta, which this Assembly views as a clear violation of provincial jurisdiction, including the launching of a constitutional challenge if necessary; acknowledge the negative impacts that a carbon tax has upon the people of Alberta, including the increased cost to heat homes and run businesses in the midst of an economic downturn; and recognize that Alberta's oil and gas industries continue to be global leaders in emissions reduction.

A debate followed.

Pursuant to Standing Order 3(1.2), Hon. Mr. Nixon, Government House Leader, advised the Assembly that there would be no morning sitting on Wednesday, June 26, 2019.

Hon. Mr. Nixon, Government House Leader, requested and received the unanimous consent of the Assembly to shorten the interval between division bells to one minute for the remainder of the evening.

Debate continued on the motion.

Debate adjourned, Mr. Smith speaking.

Government Bills and Orders

Third Reading

Pursuant to Standing Order 64(5), at 10:15 p.m. the Speaker interrupted the proceedings and immediately put the questions on the Appropriation Bills standing on the Order Paper for Third Reading.

The following Bills were read a Third time and passed:

Bill 5 Appropriation (Supplementary Supply) Act, 2019 (\$) —Hon. Mr. Toews

Bill 6 Appropriation (Interim Supply) Act, 2019 (\$) — Hon. Mr. Toews

Government Motions

21. Oral notice having been given June 17, 2019, moved by Hon. Mr. Nixon:

Be it resolved that the Legislative Assembly express its support for the Government in its efforts to challenge the federal government's attempts to impose a carbon tax on Alberta, which this Assembly views as a clear violation of provincial jurisdiction, including the launching of a constitutional challenge if necessary; acknowledge the negative impacts that a carbon tax has upon the people of Alberta, including the increased cost to heat homes and run businesses in the midst of an economic downturn; and recognize that Alberta's oil and gas industries continue to be global leaders in emissions reduction.

A debate followed.

The question being put, the motion was agreed to. With Hon. Mr. Cooper in the Chair, the names being called for were taken as follows:

For the motion: 50

Aheer	Long	Sawhney
Allard	Lovely	Schow
Armstrong-Homeniuk	Luan	Schweitzer
Barnes	Madu	Sigurdson (Highwood)
Copping	McIver	Singh
Ellis	Milliken	Smith
Getson	Neudorf	Stephan
Glasgo	Nicolaides	Toews
Glubish	Nixon (Calgary-Klein)	Toor
Guthrie	Nixon (Rimbey-Rocky Mtn. House-Sundre)	Turton
Hanson	Orr	van Dijken
Horner	Pon	Walker
Hunter	Rehn	Williams
Issik	Rosin	Wilson
Jones	Rowswell	Yao
Kenney	Rutherford	Yaseen
LaGrange	Savage	

Against the motion: 12

Bilous	Gray	Phillips
Carson	Hoffman	Renaud
Ceci	Irwin	Sabir
Dach	Notley	Sigurdson (Edmonton-Riverview)

Hon. Mr. Nixon, Government House Leader, requested and received the unanimous consent of the Assembly to shorten the interval between division bells to one minute for the duration of Committee of the Whole consideration for the evening.

Government Bills and Orders

Committee of the Whole

According to Order, the Assembly resolved itself into Committee of the Whole and the Speaker left the Chair.

(Assembly in Committee)

And after some time spent therein, the Acting Speaker assumed the Chair.

Progress was reported on the following Bill:

Bill 2 An Act to Make Alberta Open for Business — Hon. Mr. Copping

Mr. Hanson, Acting Chair of Committees, tabled copies of all amendments considered by Committee of the Whole on this date for the official records of the Assembly.

Amendment to Bill 2 (A1) (introduced by the Hon. Member for Edmonton-Manning on June 19, 2019) — Defeated

Sessional Paper 95/2019

Amendment to Bill 2 (A2) (Hon. Member for Lethbridge-West) — Adjourned

Sessional Paper 133/2019

Adjournment

Pursuant to Standing Order 3(1.2) and on motion by Hon. Mr. Nixon, Government House Leader, the Assembly adjourned at 11:42 p.m. until Wednesday, June 26, 2019, at 1:30 p.m.

Hon. Nathan M. Cooper,
Speaker

Title: Tuesday, June 25, 2019